Check for updates

# Last glacial atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> decline due to widespread Pacific deep-water expansion

J. Yu<sup>1</sup>,<sup>1</sup>,<sup>2</sup>, L. Menviel<sup>3</sup>, Z. D. Jin<sup>2,4,5</sup>, R. F. Anderson<sup>6</sup>, Z. Jian<sup>7</sup>, A. M. Piotrowski<sup>8</sup>, X. Ma<sup>2</sup>, E. J. Rohling<sup>1,9</sup>, F. Zhang<sup>2,4</sup>, G. Marino<sup>1,10</sup> and J. F. McManus<sup>6</sup>

Ocean circulation critically affects the global climate and atmospheric carbon dioxide through redistribution of heat and carbon in the Earth system. Despite intensive research, the nature of past ocean circulation changes remains elusive. Here we present deep-water carbonate ion concentration reconstructions for widely distributed locations in the Atlantic Ocean, where low carbonate ion concentrations indicate carbon-rich waters. These data show a low-carbonate-ion water mass that extended northward up to about 20°S in the South Atlantic at 3-4 km depth during the Last Glacial Maximum. In combination with radiocarbon ages, neodymium isotopes and carbon isotopes, we conclude that this low-carbonate-ion signal reflects a widespread expansion of carbon-rich Pacific deep waters into the South Atlantic, revealing a glacial deep Atlantic circulation scheme different than commonly considered. Comparison of high-resolution carbonate ion records from different water depths in the South Atlantic indicates that this Pacific deep-water expansion developed from approximately 38,000 to 28,000 years ago. We infer that its associated carbon sequestration may have contributed critically to the contemporaneous decline in atmospheric carbon dioxide, thereby helping to initiate the glacial maximum.

cean circulation and the carbon cycle are intricately linked, thus ocean circulation reconstructions can provide important insights into the mechanisms of past atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> changes. Circulation in the deep (more than ~2.5 km) Atlantic during the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM; 18-22 thousand years ago (ka)) is traditionally viewed as following a mixing model between deep waters formed in the basin's polar regions, without much contribution from waters from other oceans<sup>1-4</sup>. Using this long-held ocean circulation model, however, it is difficult to explain the observed older radiocarbon (14C) ages and more radiogenic neodymium isotopic (ENd) signatures at ~3.8 km than at ~5 km in the LGM South Atlantic<sup>5,6</sup> (Fig. 1). Burke et al.<sup>7</sup> showed that sluggish recirculation of southern-sourced waters combined with reduced mixing with 14C-rich northern-sourced waters can contribute to old <sup>14</sup>C ages at ~3.8 km, in the absence of interocean water-mass interactions. Yet, additional mechanisms are probably needed to fully explain the depth structure and large magnitude of <sup>14</sup>C age changes, along with the more radiogenic ENd signal observed at 3.8 km (Fig. 1). Pacific Deep Water (PDW) can notably affect deglacial ENd signatures in the Drake Passage (Southern Ocean)<sup>8</sup>, but their role in the deep South Atlantic during the LGM remains unexplored. PDW stores a large amount of respired carbon<sup>9,10</sup>, thus temporal changes in its volumetric extent would have important implications for past atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> levels.

Deep-water carbonate ion concentrations ( $[CO_3^{2-}]$ ) can provide critical information about past deep ocean circulation and dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) changes. In the modern Atlantic, contrasting  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  signatures between water masses reflect ocean circulation patterns<sup>11</sup> (Fig. 2). Also, past DIC changes may be quantified

from  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  reconstructions<sup>12</sup>. Here we present deep-water  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  reconstructions for extensive locations in the Atlantic to decipher the role of ocean circulation in the glacial atmospheric  $CO_2$  decrease. We focus on deep South Atlantic hydrography, which remains incompletely understood despite intensive studies<sup>5-8,13-16</sup>.

#### First meridional [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] transect for the LGM Atlantic

We have reconstructed deep-water  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  using benthic B/Ca for the Holocene (0–5 ka) and LGM samples from 41 cores (Fig. 2 and Extended Data Figs. 1–3). Five cores at 3.0–4.2 km and an abyssal core at ~5 km from the South Atlantic were chosen to investigate the reasons for the <sup>14</sup>C and eNd anomalies at 3.8 km water depth (Figs. 1 and 2a). Thirty additional cores from widely spread locations (1.1– 4.7 km, 36° S to 62° N) in the Atlantic and five cores at 3–4 km from the equatorial Pacific provide a broader context of water-mass signatures. Benthic B/Ca is converted into deep-water  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  using species-specific global core-top calibrations<sup>17</sup>. The uncertainty associated with  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  reconstructions is ~5 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup> (ref. <sup>17</sup>). Detailed information about the samples and analytical methods along with new (n = 173 samples) and compiled (n = 260 samples) data is given in Methods and Supplementary Tables 1–7.

Figure 2c shows the first meridional  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  transect for the deep Atlantic during the LGM (Methods). Given the locations of the studied cores, this transect mainly reflects  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  distributions for eastern Atlantic basins. Future work is needed to investigate the extent of zonal homogeneity in the LGM Atlantic. Above ~2.5 km, the  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  of glacial North Atlantic waters reached up to ~140 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup>, which is ~20 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup> higher than in modern North Atlantic Deep Water (NADW)<sup>11</sup>. These waters likely represent the previously

<sup>1</sup>Research School of Earth Sciences, The Australian National University, Canberra, Australian Capital Territory, Australia. <sup>2</sup>State Key Laboratory of Loess and Quaternary Geology, Institute of Earth Environment, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Xi'an, China. <sup>3</sup>Climate Change Research Centre, University of New South Wales, Sydney, New South Wales, Australia. <sup>4</sup>CAS Center for Excellence in Quaternary Science and Global Change, Xi'an, China. <sup>5</sup>Open Studio for Oceanic-Continental Climate and Environment Changes, Qingdao National Laboratory for Marine Science and Technology, Qingdao, China.
 <sup>6</sup>Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory, Columbia University, New York, NY, USA. <sup>7</sup>State Key Laboratory of Marine Geology, Tongji University, Shanghai, China. <sup>8</sup>Department of Earth Sciences, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK. <sup>9</sup>Ocean and Earth Science, National Oceanography Centre, University of Southampton, Southampton, UK. <sup>10</sup>Centro de Investigación Mariña, GEOMA, Palaeoclimatology Lab, Universidade de Vigo, Vigo, Spain.



**Fig. 1 | Comparison of**  $\varepsilon$ **Nd and** <sup>14</sup>**C ages at 3.8 and 5 km water depths in the South Atlantic Ocean. a**,  $\varepsilon$ Nd, with error bars showing  $2\sigma$  analytical uncertainties. **b**, <sup>14</sup>C ages, with error bars showing combined planktonic/ benthic <sup>14</sup>C date uncertainties ( $2\sigma$ ). Note that the shallower core MD07-3076Q had more Pacific-like  $\varepsilon$ Nd and <sup>14</sup>C-age signatures than the abyssal core TN057-21 during the LGM. See Fig. 2 for core locations. Data are from refs. <sup>5,614,15</sup>. HOL, Holocene.

documented well-ventilated Glacial North Atlantic Intermediate Water (GNAIW)<sup>1,2,18–20</sup>. Below ~2.5 km, LGM North Atlantic [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2–</sup>] values were up to ~20 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup> lower than today, consistent with greater mixing/advection of low-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2–</sup>] Glacial Antarctic Bottom Water (GAABW) and/or increased biological respiration in the glacial ocean<sup>1,2,19,21–23</sup>. The boundary between LGM upper and lower water masses at ~2.5 km is consistent with reconstructions from other proxies ( $\delta^{13}$ C, Cd/Ca and  $\epsilon$ Nd) and modelling<sup>1–3,19,24,25</sup>.

In the South Atlantic, deep-water  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  in the five studied cores from ~3–4 km water depth are lower by ~20 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup> during the LGM than the Holocene, consistent with the sign of the change obtained from qualitative  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  proxies from the same cores<sup>26–28</sup> (Extended Data Fig. 2). By contrast, opposite LGM–Holocene  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  changes are observed in abyssal core TNO57-21 (41.1°S, 7.8° E, 4,981 m). TNO57-21 shows slightly higher abyssal  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  during the LGM than the Holocene, supported by multiple benthic B/Ca measurements in this core and qualitative proxies (%CaCO<sub>3</sub> and foraminiferal fragmentation) for several South Atlantic cores at similar depths<sup>15,26,27</sup> (Extended Data Fig. 3). Our data reveal that a low- $[CO_3^{2-}]$  (<80 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup>) water mass, centred at ~3.5 km and extending northward up to ~20° S, overlays a relatively high- $[CO_3^{2-}]$  (>80 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup>) abyssal water mass in the LGM South Atlantic (Fig. 2c).

#### Circulation and biological influences within the Atlantic

Below, we discuss the nature of our newly discovered low- $[CO_3^{2-}]$  deep South Atlantic water mass (Fig. 2). Deep-water  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  is affected by changes in endmember values, biological respiration and water-mass mixing. We combine  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  with benthic  $\delta^{13}C$  and  $\epsilon$ Nd to investigate the influences of these processes (Fig. 3). To provide a context, we start with the Holocene data. Modern water-mass endmember values are assigned following literature<sup>1,3,23</sup>. As shown in Fig. 3a,b, Holocene deep-water signatures at the studied cores,

including the five cores at  $\sim$ 3–4km from the South Atlantic, fall along the NADW–AABW mixing trends, consistent with established knowledge<sup>1–3,19</sup>.

For the LGM, we first investigate water-mass endmember changes (Fig. 3c,d). To do so, we identify sites with benthic  $\delta^{13}$ C values similar to the  $\delta^{13}$ C endmembers defined by refs. <sup>1-3,19</sup>. Deep-water  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  reconstructions for these sites are then chosen as corresponding [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] water-mass endmembers. Thus, we choose  $\delta^{13}C = \sim 1.5\%$  and  $[CO_3^{2-}] = \sim 140 \,\mu\text{mol kg}^{-1}$  as endmember values for GNAIW, and  $\delta^{13}C \approx -0.8\%$  and  $[CO_3^{2-}] \approx 85 \mu mol$ kg<sup>-1</sup> for GAABW (Extended Data Fig. 4). The ɛNd endmember for GNAIW is debated<sup>3,29</sup>, and we assign a range of values from approximately -13.5 to -10.5 to this water mass. Using other  $\varepsilon$ Nd values for GNAIW would have little influence on our conclusions, as long as GNAIW had less radiogenic ENd than GAABW. For GAABW, we choose LGM ENd measurements (approximately -6.7) from TNO57-21<sup>6</sup>, the same site used to pin down  $\delta^{13}$ C and [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] endmember values<sup>1</sup>. Our choice is different from ref.<sup>3</sup>, which used LGM measurements from MD07-3076Q to characterize GAABW eNd. Compared with TNO57-21 (5km), MD07-3076Q (44.2°S, 14.2° W, 3770 m) is located at a much shallower water depth near the mid-ocean ridge, and was bathed in warmer and less saline deep waters during the LGM<sup>30</sup>. By contrast, core TNO57-21 was retrieved from the abyssal Cape Basin, and is ideally located downstream of AABW formed on Antarctic shelves. Previous pore-water reconstructions suggest extremely cold and saline waters in the abyssal Cape Basin during the LGM<sup>16</sup>, lending strong support to the use of TNO57-21 for determining GAABW endmember values.

Given the above endmember values, it is impossible to explain the low- $[CO_3^{2-}]$  water-mass signature at ~3-4 km in the LGM South Atlantic by conservative mixing between GNAIW and GAABW, because this water mass had even lower [CO32-] values than GAABW (Figs. 2 and 3). Previous work<sup>7,31,32</sup> proposed sluggish GAABW recirculation in the lower cell (deeper than ~2.5 km) of the Atlantic during the LGM. In this case, the South Atlantic low- $[CO_3^{2-}]$  signature at ~3-4km might be viewed as a consequence of respired carbon accumulation due to water-mass aging, analogous to the cause of today's low-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] signature of PDW<sup>11,33</sup> (Extended Data Fig. 5). Respiration would decrease  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  along the Redfield slope, with little impact on  $\varepsilon Nd^{3,23}$ . If the low-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] in the five South Atlantic cores was due to enhanced respiration effects, then the combined  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  and  $\delta^{13}C$  values would imply an almost pure GNAIW source water (Fig. 3c). However, this is contradicted by much more radiogenic  $\varepsilon$ Nd values (-5 to -9) than those of GNAIW (approximately -13.5 to -10.5) (Fig. 3d). Therefore, the low-[CO32-] signature of the LGM South Atlantic water mass at 3-4 km cannot be explained by a combination of mixing and respiration that involves only GNAIW and GAABW.

#### **Glacial Pacific deep-water expansion into the Atlantic**

Considering that deep waters from the Pacific generally have high DIC and low  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  values<sup>9,11,18</sup>, we explore whether the low- $[CO_3^{2-}]$ water mass recorded by the five South Atlantic cores was affected by Glacial Pacific Deep Water (GPDW). The GPDW endmember  $\delta^{13}C$  and  $\epsilon Nd$  values are set to -0.4% and -3.5, respectively  $^{34-36}$ (Fig. 3 and Extended Data Fig. 4). Currently, there are no benthic B/Ca data to define the GPDW [CO32-] endmember because of intensive dissolution and scarce occurrence of the required species (see Methods) in the deep North Pacific. Nevertheless, foraminiferal assemblage and boron isotope (based on mixed species of genus *Cibicidoides*) data<sup>37,38</sup> suggest similar [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] values between the Holocene and LGM in this region. Therefore, we assume that GPDW had the same endmember [CO32-] (~50 µmol kg-1) as modern PDW. We acknowledge potential uncertainties with this endmember, but our main conclusion requires only that GPDW had lower [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] than GAABW, which is supported by published

# ARTICLES



**Fig. 2 | Modern and LGM Atlantic meridional [CO**<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] **transects. a,b**, Modern  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  (unit:  $\mu$ mol kg<sup>-1</sup>) transect (**a**) for hydrographic sites compiled by the GLODAP dataset (**b**)<sup>11</sup>. **c,d**, LGM  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  transect (**c**) reconstructed using  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  reconstructions for all studied cores (**d**) (dots and white filled circles shown in **c** and **d**). Average  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  reconstruction uncertainty is 5  $\mu$ mol kg<sup>-1</sup> (1 $\sigma$ ). White filled circles shown in **a** and **c** denote locations of the five cores at 3-4 km and an abyssal core at -5 km from the South Atlantic. Bright yellow labelling indicates the locations of cores TNO57-21 and MD07-3076Q, whose long records are investigated (Fig. 4). Maps were generated using Ocean Data View<sup>50</sup> (see Methods).

data<sup>18,39-42</sup>. Located downstream of GPDW, all examined cores at 3–4km from the equatorial Pacific show lower LGM  $[CO_3^{2-}]$ (61–76µmol kg<sup>-1</sup>) than GAABW (>80µmol kg<sup>-1</sup>) (Fig. 3c). In the modern ocean, PDW  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  increases during its southward transport due to mixing with younger, lower-DIC waters (Extended Data Fig. 5). Benthic  $\delta^{13}$ C mapping<sup>34</sup> indicates that the basic ocean circulation pattern seen today operated in the LGM Pacific. Therefore, GPDW likely had a lower  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  than GAABW, a situation also expected from much older ages and likely more respired carbon contents in GPDW<sup>38,43</sup>.

In the  $[CO_3^{2-}] - \delta^{13}C$  space, data from the five South Atlantic cores suggest a mixing scheme involving three water masses: GNAIW, GAABW and GPDW (Fig. 3c). Deep-water [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] and εNd values at these locations can be explained by mixing GPDW with aged GNAIW-GAABW mixtures (Fig. 3d), although insufficient knowledge of endmember ENd and Nd contents precludes exact quantification of mixing and respiration effects (Extended Data Figs. 6 and 7). Paired [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>]-<sup>14</sup>C age data are too limited to allow a detailed investigation, but mixing of GPDW into the LGM South Atlantic is qualitatively consistent with the very old ventilation age at MD07-3076Q (Fig. 1)<sup>5</sup>. Therefore, we attribute the low  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  values at 3–4 km in the LGM South Atlantic to the admixture of low-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] GPDW. The presence of low- $[CO_3^{2-}]$  deep water as far north as ~20° S in the South Atlantic suggests a substantial expansion of GPDW during the LGM (Fig. 2c). This is different from the long-held view that largely focuses on changes in water masses formed solely within the glacial Atlantic.

Prevailing evidence suggests a sluggish circulation, characterized by reduced water-mass mixing in the LGM Pacific Ocean<sup>24,25,34</sup>. This would allow southward expansion of the recirculated GPDW and better preservation of its low  $[CO_3^{2-}]$ , more radiogenic  $\varepsilon$ Nd and old <sup>14</sup>C age signatures during transport. This is supported by findings of a 'floating' high-DIC, low-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] and very old deep water in the equatorial and South Pacific during the LGM<sup>18,44</sup>. Entrainment into the Antarctic Circumpolar Current at the latitude of the Drake Passage (~60°S) would have facilitated GPDW transport into the South Atlantic<sup>33</sup>, analogous to what happens today, albeit with greater GPDW influences in the LGM Southern Ocean (Extended Data Fig. 8). In contrast to the vigorous and deep southward NADW transport today, shoaled GNAIW formation would allow greater northward expansion of GPDW in the deep (greater than ~2.5 km) Atlantic at the LGM (Fig. 2). Owing to inevitable mixing with surrounding waters during transport, we use the term modified GPDW (mGPDW) in Fig. 2c.

It is worth noting that our proposed GPDW expansion does not necessarily exclude deep-water recirculation within the LGM Atlantic, as suggested previously<sup>7</sup>. Both processes may be needed to fully explain proxy data in the LGM ocean. We also note that while GAABW  $\delta^{13}$ C is a matter of long-standing debate<sup>45</sup>, alternative scenarios to define this endmember do not affect our conclusions (Extended Data Fig. 9 and Methods).

## Timing of GPDW expansion and atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> decline

To determine the timing of GPDW expansion, we have extended the previously published  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  record  $(0-27 \text{ ka})^{42}$  to 60 ka for core



**Fig. 3** | [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] versus  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\epsilon$ Nd. a, Holocene  $\delta^{13}$ C versus [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>]. b, Holocene  $\epsilon$ Nd versus [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>]. c, LGM  $\delta^{13}$ C versus [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>]. d, LGM  $\epsilon$ Nd versus [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>]. Red circles show sites at 3-4 km from the South Atlantic (Fig. 2), compared with other Atlantic locations (blue circles) and sites at 3-4 km from the equatorial Pacific Ocean (cyan squares). Grey circles show modern hydrographic data<sup>11</sup> (Supplementary Table 6). Large yellow circles/ovals represent endmember values (Extended Data Fig. 4). The yellow triangle in d denotes a hypothetical aged GNAIW-GAABW mixture, but also note other scenarios (Extended Data Fig. 6). Green dashed lines (a,c) represent the Redfield slope<sup>23</sup>, whereas dashed arrows (b,d) indicate biological respiration effects. Grey lines/curves/shaded regions show conservative mixing of water masses. The mixing curvature for  $\delta^{13}C$ -[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] is almost linear, but that for  $\epsilon$ Nd-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] is much greater due to large endmember [Nd] contrasts (Extended Data Fig. 7). Owing to biological respiration and uncertainties associated with endmember values including [Nd] and  $\epsilon$ Nd, mixing trends should be treated as a guide for qualitative, not quantitative, estimates of mixing effects. Error bars are one standard deviation of reconstructions for each core. See Methods for details.

TNO57-21 (downstream of GAABW), and then compared it with a published [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] record for core MD07-3076Q<sup>28</sup>, which is located close to the core of the low- $[CO_3^{2-}]$  water mass (Figs. 2 and 4). Before ~38 ka, the long-term deep-water [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] at 3.8 km (MD07-3076Q) was slightly higher than at 5 km (TNO57-21), similar to the modern bathymetric [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] distribution in the South Atlantic<sup>11</sup> (Fig. 2a). From ~38 to ~28 ka, a reversal of the vertical  $[CO_3^{2-}]$ gradient developed between the two depths, coeval with a substantial aging of deep waters at MD07-3076Q<sup>46</sup>. We suggest that the development of this [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] gradient reversal reflects sizable GPDW expansion. This reversal broadly corresponded to the maximum advance of the Antarctic ice sheet, possibly associated with a GAABW weakening<sup>24</sup>. If so, reduced GAABW production might have facilitated the development of the low- $[CO_3^{2-}]$  anomaly at 3-4km in the South Atlantic. Over the entire duration of the LGM, deep-water [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] at 3.8 km was persistently ~15 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup> lower than at 5 km, suggesting full establishment of low-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] GPDW expansion in the South Atlantic (Fig. 2). Superimposed on the long-term changes, we find that deep-water  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  converged between MD07-3076 and TNO57-21 during Heinrich Stadials, consistent with previously reconstructed erosion of chemical gradients in the deep Southern Ocean due to enhanced vertical mixing<sup>46,47</sup>. Overall, the large and reversed [CO32-] gradient between MD07-3076Q and TNO57-21 lends strong observational support to the

role of sluggish ocean circulation in sequestering carbon during the LGM<sup>24,25</sup>.

Our deep-water [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] reconstructions offer a means to quantify carbon storage changes in the past. Below 3km water depth, Atlantic [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] was ~15 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup> lower on average during the LGM relative to the Holocene (Fig. 2 and Extended Data Fig. 10). Based on the relationship from ref. 12, this suggests an increase of at least ~25µmol kg<sup>-1</sup> in DIC. Using a mass of  $10 \times 10^{19}$  kg for waters below 3 km in the Atlantic, this implies that the deep Atlantic sequestered ~30 gigatonnes of extra carbon during the LGM relative to the Holocene. However, this estimate probably represents a lower limit of carbon sequestration. If our inferred GPDW expansion is correct, then it would imply extensive occupation of low-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] and high-DIC deep waters in the voluminous Indo-Pacific oceans. Respired carbon contents are high in the deep Pacific today, and may have been even higher during the LGM, as suggested by reduced glacial deep-sea O<sub>2</sub> levels<sup>9,10,48</sup>. By sequestering more respired carbon and nutrient in the ocean interior, GPDW expansion would have decreased the preformed nutrient levels<sup>10</sup>, enhanced the global biological pump efficiency and thus contributed to lowering atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Given coeval low-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] water-mass formation and the ~20 ppm atmospheric  $CO_2$  drop<sup>49</sup> (Fig. 4), we suggest that expansion of high-DIC GPDW was a key contributor to the final atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>



**Fig. 4 | South Atlantic [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] reconstructions at 3.8 and 5 km water depths compared with atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> during the last 60 ka. a**, Deepwater [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] for TNO57-21 (0-27 ka: ref. <sup>42</sup>; 27-60 ka: this study) and MD07-3076Q<sup>28</sup>. Age models (crosses) are from ref. <sup>27</sup>. Dark- and light-red envelopes represent 1 $\sigma$  and 2 $\sigma$  uncertainties, respectively (Methods). The thick blue curve shows the 3 kyr smoothing mean. **b**, Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> (ref. <sup>49</sup>). The arrow represents the last -20 ppm atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> drawdown during the last glacial cycle, which was coeval with the reversal of the [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] gradient between MD07-3076Q and TNO57-21. HS, Heinrich Stadial.

drawdown and thereby helped push the global climate into glacial maximum conditions.

#### Online content

Any methods, additional references, Nature Research reporting summaries, source data, extended data, supplementary information, acknowledgements, peer review information; details of author contributions and competing interests; and statements of data and code availability are available at https://doi.org/10.1038/ s41561-020-0610-5.

Received: 25 March 2019; Accepted: 11 June 2020; Published online: 20 July 2020

#### References

- Oppo, D. et al. Data constraints on glacial Atlantic water mass geometry and properties. *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* 33, 1013–1034 (2018).
- 2. Lynch-Stieglitz, J. et al. Atlantic meridional overturning circulation during the Last Glacial Maximum. *Science* **316**, 66–69 (2007).
- 3. Howe, J. N. W. et al. North Atlantic Deep Water production during the Last Glacial Maximum. *Nat. Commun.* 7, 11765 (2016).
- Gebbie, G. How much did Glacial North Atlantic Water shoal? *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* 29, 190–209 (2014).
- Skinner, L., Fallon, S. J., Waelbroeck, C., Michel, E. & Barker, S. Ventilation of the deep Southern Ocean and deglacial CO<sub>2</sub> rise. *Science* 328, 1147–1151 (2010).
- Piotrowski, A. et al. Reconstructing deglacial North and South Atlantic deep water sourcing using foraminiferal Nd isotopes. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 357–358, 289–297 (2012).
- Burke, A. et al. The glacial mid-depth radiocarbon bulge and its implications for the overturning circulation. *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* 30, 1021–1039 (2015).
- Robinson, L. F. & van de Flierdt, T. Southern Ocean evidence for reduced export of North Atlantic Deep Water during Heinrich event 1. *Geology* 37, 195–198 (2009).
- Anderson, R. F. et al. Deep-sea oxygen depletion and ocean carbon sequestration during the last ice age. *Glob. Biogeochem. Cycles* 33, 301–317 (2019).

- Jaccard, S. L. & Galbraith, E. D. Large climate-driven changes of oceanic oxygen concentrations during the last deglaciation. *Nat. Geosci.* 5, 151–156 (2012).
- Key, R. M. et al. A global ocean carbon climatology: results from Global Data Analysis Project (GLODAP). *Glob. Biogeochem. Cycles* 18, GB4031 (2004).
- 12. Yu, J. et al. Sequestration of carbon in the deep Atlantic during the last glaciation. *Nat. Geosci.* 9, 319–324 (2016).
- Burke, A. & Robinson, L. F. The Southern Ocean's role in carbon exchange during the last deglaciation. *Science* 335, 557–561 (2012).
- 14. Skinner, L. C. et al. North Atlantic versus Southern Ocean contributions to a deglacial surge in deep ocean ventilation. *Geology* **41**, 667–670 (2013).
- Barker, S., Knorr, G., Vautravers, M., Diz, P. & Skinner, L. Extreme deepening of the Atlantic overturning circulation during deglaciation. *Nat. Geosci.* 3, 567–571 (2010).
- 16. Adkins, J. F., McIntyre, K. & Schrag, D. P. The salinity, temperature, and  $\delta^{18}$ O of the glacial deep ocean. *Science* **298**, 1769–1773 (2002).
- Yu, J. M. & Elderfield, H. Benthic foraminiferal B/Ca ratios reflect deep water carbonate saturation state. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 258, 73–86 (2007).
- Yu, J. et al. Loss of carbon from the deep sea since the Last Glacial Maximum. Science 330, 1084–1087 (2010).
- Marchitto, T. & Broeker, W. Deep water mass geometry in the glacial Atlantic Ocean: a review of constraints from the paleonutrient proxy Cd/Ca. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.* 7, (2006).
- Yu, J. More efficient North Atlantic carbon pump during the Last Glacial Maximum. Nat. Commun. 10, 2170 (2019).
- Chalk, T. B., Foster, G. L. & Wilson, P. A. Dynamic storage of glacial CO<sub>2</sub> in the Atlantic Ocean revealed by boron [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2–</sup>] and pH records. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **510**, 1–11 (2019).
- Broecker, W., Yu, J. & Putnam, A. E. Two contributors to the glacial CO<sub>2</sub> decline. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 429, 191–196 (2015).
- Yu, J. M., Elderfield, H. & Piotrowski, A. Seawater carbonate ion-δ<sup>13</sup>C systematics and application to glacial-interglacial North Atlantic Ocean circulation. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 271, 209–220 (2008).
- Menviel, L. et al. Poorly ventilated deep ocean at the Last Glacial Maximum inferred from carbon isotopes: a data-model comparison study. *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* 31, 2–17 (2017).
- Muglia, J., Skinner, L. & Schmittner, A. Weak overturning circulation and high Southern Ocean nutrient utilization maximized glacial ocean carbon. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 496, 47–56 (2018).
- Hodell, D. A., Charles, C. D. & Sierro, F. J. Late Pleistocene evolution of the ocean's carbonate system. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 192, 109–124 (2001).
- Gottschalk, J. et al. Past carbonate preservation events in the deep southeast Atlantic Ocean (Cape Basin) and their implications for Atlantic overturning dynamics and marine carbon cycling. *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* 33, 643–663 (2018).
- Gottschalk, J. et al. Abrupt changes in the southern extent of North Atlantic Deep Water during Dansgaard–Oeschger events. *Nat. Geosci.* 8, 950–954 (2015).
- Zhao, N. et al. Glacial-interglacial Nd isotope variability of North Atlantic Deep Water modulated by North American ice sheet. *Nat. Commun.* 10, 5773 (2019).
- Roberts, J. et al. Evolution of South Atlantic density and chemical stratification across the last deglaciation. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA 113, 514–519 (2016).
- Ferrari, R. et al. Antarctic sea ice control on ocean circulation in present and glacial climates. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA 111, 8753–8758 (2014).
- Adkins, J. F. The role of deep ocean circulation in setting glacial climates. Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol. 28, 539–561 (2013).
- Talley, L. D. Closure of the global overturning circulation through the Indian, Pacific, and Southern oceans: schematics and transports. *Oceanography* 26, 80–97 (2013).
- Matsumoto, K., Oba, T., Lynch-Stieglitz, J. & Yamamoto, H. Interior hydrography and circulation of the glacial Pacific Ocean. Q. Sci. Rev. 21, 1693–1704 (2002).
- 35. Hu, R., Piotrowski, A. M., Bostock, H. C., Crowhurst, S. & Rennie, V. Variability of neodymium isotopes associated with planktonic foraminifera in the Pacific Ocean during the Holocene and Last Glacial Maximum. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **447**, 130–138 (2016).
- Keigwin, L. D. North Pacific deep water formation during the latest glaciation. *Nature* 330, 362–364 (1987).
- Anderson, D. M. & Archer, D. Glacial-interglacial stability of ocean pH inferred from foraminifer dissolution rates. *Nature* 416, 70–73 (2002).
- Rae, J. W. B. et al. Deep water formation in the North Pacific and deglacial CO<sub>2</sub> rise. *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* 29, 645–667 (2014).
- Umling, N. E. & Thunell, R. C. Mid-depth respired carbon storage and oxygenation of the eastern equatorial Pacific over the last 25,000 years. Q. Sci. Rev. 189, 43–56 (2018).
- Doss, W. & Marchitto, T. M. Glacial deep ocean sequestration of CO<sub>2</sub> driven by the eastern equatorial Pacific biologic pump. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 377, 43–54 (2013).

## **NATURE GEOSCIENCE**

- Kerr, J., Rickaby, R., Yu, J. M., Elderfield, H. & Sadekov, A. Y. The effect of ocean alkalinity and carbon transfer on deep-sea carbonate ion concentration during the past five glacial cycles. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **471**, 42–53 (2017).
- Yu, J. et al. Deep South Atlantic carbonate chemistry and increased interocean deep water exchange during last deglaciation. Q. Sci. Rev. 15, 80–89 (2014).
- Galbraith, E. D. et al. Carbon dioxide release from the North Pacific abyss during the last deglaciation. *Nature* 449, 890–893 (2007).
- 44. Ronge, T. A. et al. Radiocarbon constraints on the extent and evolution of the South Pacific glacial carbon pool. *Nat. Commun.* **7**, 11487 (2016).
- 45. Gottschalk, J. et al. Carbon isotope offsets between benthic foraminifer species of the genus *Cibicides* (*Cibicidoides*) in the glacial sub-Antarctic Atlantic. *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* **31**, 1583–1602 (2016).
- Gottschalk, J. et al. Biological and physical controls in the Southern Ocean on past millennial-scale atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> changes. *Nat. Commun.* 7, 11539 (2016).

- Basak, C. et al. Breakup of last glacial deep stratification in the South Pacific. Science 359, 900–904 (2018).
- Jacobel, A. W., McManus, J. F., Anderson, R. F. & Winckler, G. Repeated storage of respired carbon in the equatorial Pacific Ocean over the last three glacial cycles. *Nat. Commun.* 8, 1727 (2017).
- 49. Bereiter, B. et al. Revision of the EPICA Dome C CO2 record from 800 to 600 kyr before present. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **42**, 542–549 (2015).
- 50. Schlitzer, R. Ocean Data View v.5.3.0 (Alfred Wegener Institute, 2006); https://odv.awi.de/

**Publisher's note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

© The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Limited 2020

#### Methods

Samples and analytical methods. For the LGM Atlantic transect mapping (Fig. 2), we measured (n = 19 cores) and compiled (n = 22 cores) benthic B/Ca for 41 sediment cores from the Atlantic and Pacific oceans. Age models are based on published chronologies (Supplementary Table 1). For three cores, samples from below ~8 ka are treated as the Holocene age (defined as 0-5 ka here), but exclusion of these samples does not affect our conclusion. For new samples analysed in this study, sediments (~10-20 cm3 from ~2 cm thickness each) were disaggregated in de-ionized water and wet sieved through 63 µm sieves. Except for Ocean Drilling Program (ODP) site 1087, for which Cibicidoides mundulus was used, we picked Cibicides wuellerstorfi (generally ~10-20 tests for each sample) from the 250-500 µm size fraction. The shells were double checked under a microscope before crushing to ensure consistent shell morphology used for measurements. Following this careful screening, the starting material for each sample was on average ~8-12 shells, which is equivalent to ~300-600 µg of carbonate. For benthic B/Ca analyses, foraminiferal shells were cleaned using the 'Mg-cleaning' method<sup>51,52</sup>. Benthic B/Ca ratios were measured by inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry using procedures outlined in ref. 53, with an analytical error better than ~5%. Regarding down-core analyses for TNO57-21, we have extended the benthic B/Ca record back to 60 ka, following the same approach as given in ref.  $^{\rm 42}.$  We have also measured benthic foraminifera stable isotopes for four cores, with analytical precision of ~0.08% for  $\delta^{18}O$  and  $\delta^{13}C.$ 

All new (n = 173 samples) and compiled (n = 260 samples) [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] reconstructions together with paired benthic  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\epsilon$ Nd are provided in Supplementary Tables 1–7.

**Deep-water**  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  **reconstructions.** Deep-water  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  values are reconstructed using benthic B/Ca (refs. <sup>12,17</sup>) from  $[CO_3^{2-}]_{downcore} = [CO_3^{2-}]_{PI} + \Delta B/Ca_{downcore-coretop}/k$ , where  $[CO_3^{2-}]_{PI}$  is the pre-industrial (PI) deep-water  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  value estimated from the GLODAP dataset<sup>11</sup>,  $\Delta B/Ca_{downcore-coretop}$  represents the deviation of B/Ca of down-core samples from the core-top value, and *k* is the B/Ca- $[CO_3^{2-}]$  sensitivity of *C. wuellerstorfi* (1.14 µmol mol<sup>-1</sup> per µmol kg<sup>-1</sup>) or *C. mundulus* (0.69 µmol mol<sup>-1</sup> per µmol kg<sup>-1</sup>)<sup>17</sup>. To calculate  $[CO_3^{2-}]_{PI}$  we have removed anthropogenic influences on DIC after ref. <sup>54</sup>. We use a reconstruction uncertainty of 5 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup> (1 $\sigma$ ) in  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  based on global core-top calibration samples<sup>17</sup>.

**Mapping of LGM** [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] **data.** Given the limited number of reconstructions that is almost always the case in palaeoceanographic studies, all cores are projected onto a single, arbitrary latitudinal-water depth plane for the LGM plotting (Fig. 2c), an approach widely used for mapping of other proxies such as  $\varepsilon Nd$  and  $\delta^{13}C^{1,3,19}$ . Ocean Data View<sup>50</sup> is employed to generate Fig. 2c using the average [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] values (Supplementary Table 2). Contours are generated using the DIVA gridding with *X* and *Y* scale-length values of 110 and 104, respectively. The quality limit is set to 7. The linear mapping option is used for colour mapping.

**Modern seawater**  $[CO_3^{2-}]-\delta^{13}C-\epsilon Nd$  data. In Fig. 3a, modern seawater  $[CO_3^{2-}]-\delta^{13}C$  data are from the GLODAP dataset<sup>11</sup>. Seawater  $\epsilon Nd$  data shown in Fig. 3b are compiled from the literature for water depths from >1 km, while their corresponding seawater  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  values are estimated using the GLODAP dataset<sup>11</sup>, not measured along with  $\epsilon Nd$  analyses. Associated data are provided in Supplementary Table 6.

Water-mass mixing. The chemical and isotopic signatures of mixtures of two waters are calculated by

$$[X]_{\mathrm{M}} = [X]_{\mathrm{A}} \times f_{\mathrm{A}} + [X]_{\mathrm{B}} \times (1 - f_{\mathrm{A}})$$

$$\tag{1}$$

$$\delta_{\rm M} \times [X]_{\rm M} = \delta_{\rm A} \times [X]_{\rm A} \times f_{\rm A} + \delta_{\rm B} \times [X]_{\rm B} \times (1 - f_{\rm A}) \tag{2}$$

where [X] and  $\delta$  are, respectively, endmember concentrations and chemical signatures of tracers (elements or compounds) of interest, subscripts A, B and M represent water masses A and B and their mixture, respectively, and  $f_A$  is the fraction of water mass A in the mixture. Here, X denotes C, Nd or DIC, while  $\delta$  represents  $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\varepsilon$ Nd or [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>]. Thus, we can obtain

$$\delta_{\mathrm{M}} = \frac{\left(\delta_{\mathrm{A}} \times [X]_{\mathrm{A}} \times f_{\mathrm{A}} + \delta_{\mathrm{B}} \times [X]_{\mathrm{B}} \times (1 - f_{\mathrm{A}})\right)}{\left([X]_{\mathrm{A}} \times f_{\mathrm{A}} + [X]_{\mathrm{B}} \times (1 - f_{\mathrm{A}})\right)} \tag{3}$$

The endmember values used to calculate 'reference' mixing curves shown in Fig. 3 are given in Extended Data Fig. 4. The endmember [Nd] values are assumed to be unchanged between modern water masses and their LGM counterparts, but it is important to note that past seawater [Nd] remains poorly constrained.

For the hypothetical aged GNAIW–GAABW mixture shown in Fig. 3d, we use  $[Nd] = 22 \text{ pmol kg}^{-1}$ ,  $\varepsilon Nd = -10$ ,  $[CO_3^{2-}] = 90 \text{ µmol kg}^{-1}$ , and  $DIC = 2,300 \text{ µmol kg}^{-1}$ . More scenarios to explain the LGM  $\varepsilon Nd$ – $[CO_3^{2-}]$  data are given in Extended Data Fig. 6.

The mixing curvature depends on the relative difference between  $[X]_A$  and  $[X]_B$ . For the  $\delta^{13}$ C– $[CO_3^{2-}]$  system, the mixing curvature is insensitive to endmember DIC changes because water-mass DIC contrasts are small (<10%)

and DIC weighting applies to both  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  and  $\delta^{13}C$ . By contrast, the curvature is greater for the  $\epsilon$ Nd– $[CO_3^{2-}]$  system, driven by the large [Nd] difference (up to ~50–100%) between water masses (Fig. 3). A sensitivity test is shown in Extended Data Fig. 7, by changing endmember [Nd] and DIC values.

Note that we assume tracers remain conservative, with no addition or removal of ingredients, during mixing of water masses. This is likely an oversimplification. Thus, mixing lines/regions shown (Fig. 3 and Extended Data Fig. 6) should be treated as a guide to aid interpretation of data instead of using them for accurate quantification of mixing ratios. Importantly, insufficient knowledge about [Nd] and the potentially large endmember eNd range for GNAIW (Fig. 3) preclude estimates of exact mixing scenarios for the LGM, although the data do provide useful clues about mixing schemes in a qualitative sense.

**Statistical analyses.** For the TNO57-21 downcore record, uncertainties associated with  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  were evaluated using a Monte Carlo approach<sup>55</sup>. Errors associated with the chronology (*x* axis) and  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  reconstructions (*y* axis) are considered during error propagation. Age errors are estimated following ref.<sup>27</sup>. The error for each  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  reconstruction is 5 µmol kg<sup>-1</sup>. All data points were sampled separately and randomly 5,000 times within their chronological and  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  uncertainties, and each iteration was then interpolated linearly. At each time step, the probability maximum and data distribution uncertainties of the 5,000 iterations were assessed. Figure 4a shows  $\pm 1\sigma$  (dark-red envelopes; 16th–84th percentile) and  $\pm 2\sigma$  (light red; 2.5th–97.5th percentile) probability intervals for the data distributions, including chronological and proxy uncertainties.

GAABW  $\delta^{13}$ C endmember. The LGM benthic  $\delta^{13}$ C in core TNO57-21 has long been used as the GAABW  $\delta^{13}$ C endmember value<sup>1,2,19</sup>. However, the extent to which the observed low benthic  $\delta^{13}$ C (approximately -0.8%) reflects seawater  $\delta^{\rm 13}C$  during the LGM is a matter of long-lasting debate, and no consensus has been reached to date<sup>45,56,57</sup>. For the scenario shown in Extended Data Fig. 9a, glacial benthic foraminiferal δ13C could be biased to lower values relative to deep-water δ13C, if epifaunal benthic species (generally thought to live above the sedimentdeep water boundary) somehow lived in pore waters or phytodetritus layers during the LGM56. In this scenario, reconstructions using benthic foraminiferal shells would reflect pore water/'fluffy' layer chemistry, instead of deep-water chemistry. Deep-water  $\delta^{13}$ C and [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] values could be inferred from TNO57-21 data and the Redfield slope (pink arrow)<sup>23</sup>. For illustration purposes, the yellow circle represents only one possibility for GAABW  $\delta^{13}$ C and [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] values, because the exact magnitude of the chemical offset between deep waters and pore water/fluffy layers remains unknown for the LGM. Nevertheless, the inferred higher  $\delta^{13}$ C and [CO32-] values for GAABW would still require mixing of GPDW to explain the low [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] signature observed in the 3-4 km of the South Atlantic.

For the scenario shown in Extended Data Fig. 9b, benthic  $\delta^{13}$ C is corrected by +0.76% (ref. <sup>45</sup>) to account for pore water influences, assuming that *Cibicidoides* (used for  $\delta^{13}$ C analyses) lived in pore waters. No correction is applied to  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  reconstructions, assuming that *C. wuellerstorfi* (used for B/Ca measurements) lived in deep waters. In this scenario, the low  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  and low  $\delta^{13}$ C observed in five cores at 3–4 km from the South Atlantic (red circles) could be explained by aging of GAABW–GNAIW mixtures. This may alleviate, but does not exclude, the need for GPDW involvement. However, the applicability of the +0.76% correction (obtained from other cores)<sup>45</sup> is yet to be justified for core TNO57-21. Also, this scenario would leave many data points (blue shaded area) plotting below the mixing trends, which is unexplained.

Both scenarios are speculative, and additional work is needed to support or disprove these possibilities. Neither scenario excludes the GPDW involvement as we suggest in this study. At present, existing evidence is insufficient to justify the reliability of these scenarios, leaving them highly speculative. Thus, we continue to use measured  $\delta^{13}$ C values of approximately -0.8% as the GAABW endmember, following previous work<sup>1,2,4,19,58</sup>. It is important to emphasize that, even considering scenarios for higher GAABW  $\delta^{13}$ C, our conclusion of GPDW expansion remains unchanged: a greater GPDW penetration into the deep South Atlantic is warranted to explain the more radiogenic  $\epsilon$ Nd observed at 3–4 km than at abyssal depths (~5 km; TNO57-21) (Figs. 1 and 3d).

#### Data availability

We have chosen not to deposit the data at this time but declare that all data presented in this study are provided in the Supplementary Tables.

#### References

- Barker, S., Greaves, M. & Elderfield, H. A. A study of cleaning procedures used for foraminiferal Mg/Ca paleothermometry. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.* 4, 8407 (2003).
- Yu, J. M., Elderfield, H., Greaves, M. & Day, J. Preferential dissolution of benthic foraminiferal calcite during laboratory reductive cleaning. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.* 8, Q06016 (2007).
- Yu, J. M., Day, J., Greaves, M. & Elderfield, H. Determination of multiple element/calcium ratios in foraminiferal calcite by quadrupole ICP-MS. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.* 6, Q08P01 (2005).

## NATURE GEOSCIENCE

- 54. Feely, R. A. et al. Impact of anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> on the CaCO<sub>3</sub> system in the oceans. *Science* **305**, 362–366 (2004).
- 55. Grant, K. M. et al. Rapid coupling between ice volume and polar temperature over the past 150,000 years. *Nature* **491**, 744–747 (2012).
- 56. Mackensen, A., Hubberten, H.-W., Bickert, T., Fischer, G. & Fütterer, D. K. The δ<sup>13</sup>C in benthic foraminiferal tests of *Fontbotia wuellerstorfi* (Schwager) relative to the δ<sup>13</sup>C of dissolved inorganic carbon in Souther Ocean deep water: implications for glacial ocean circulation models. *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* 8, 587–610 (1993).
- Hodell, D. A., Venz, K. A., Charles, C. D. & Ninnemann, U. S. Pleistocene vertical carbon isotope and carbonate gradients in the South Atlantic sector of the Southern Ocean. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.* 4, 1004 (2003).
- 58. Curry, W. B. & Oppo, D. Glacial water mass geometry and the distribution of δ<sup>13</sup>C of ∑CO<sub>2</sub> in the western Altantic Ocean. *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* 20, PA1017 (2005).

## Acknowledgements

We thank P. Wang for the long-time service with foraminifera shell picking in the laboratory. This work is supported by NSFC41676026, ARC Discovery Projects (DP140101393, DP190100894) and Future Fellowship (FT140100993) to J.Y., Future Fellowship (FT180100606) and Discovery (DP180100048) to L.M., NSFC (41991322 and 41930864) to Z.D.J. and Australian Laureate Fellowship (FL120100050) to E.J.R. The contribution of J.F.M. was supported in part by the US-NSF. J.Y. was supported in

part by the "111" Project (BP0719030) when visiting P. Cai at Xiamen University. G.M. acknowledges support from the University of Vigo's programme to attract excellent research talent, and a generous start-up package. Core materials were provided by ODP/ IODP/DSDP, LDEO (N. Anest), NOC (G. Rothwell, D. Thornalley and I. N. McCave), GEREGE (N. Thouveny) and WHOI (E. Roosen) core repositories.

#### Author contributions

J.Y. designed the project and wrote the paper. Z.D.J. and F.Z. managed shell picking. A.M.P. and J.F.M. arranged samples. A.M.P. assisted seawater neodymium data compilation. X.M. plotted Fig. 2. All authors commented on the manuscript.

### **Competing interests**

The authors declare no competing interests.

## Additional information

**Extended data** is available for this paper at https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-020-0610-5. **Supplementary information** is available for this paper at https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-020-0610-5.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to J.Y.

Peer review information Primary Handling Editor: Rebecca Neely.

Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints.

# ARTICLES



**Extended Data Fig. 1** New benthic B/Ca (red circles; unit:  $\mu$ mol/mol) against benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O (grey circles; unit:  $\%_c$ ) and the LRO4 record<sup>59</sup> (bold grey lines). For MD96-2085 and RC11-86, *G. inflata* and *G. sacculifer*  $\delta^{18}$ O (crosses) are shown, after adjusted by +1.8% and +3%, respectively. All benthic B/Ca shown are from this study. References for age models and  $\delta^{18}$ O are given in Supplementary Table 1.

59. Lisiecki, L. E. & Raymo, M. E. A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally distributed benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O records. Paleocenaogr. Paleoclimatol. 20, PA1003 (2005).



**Extended Data Fig. 2** | New and published deep-water  $[CO_3^{2^-}]$  using benthic B/Ca along with qualitative proxies for 3-4 km cores from the South Atlantic. For RC13-228, RC13-229, and TNO57-6,  $[CO_3^{2^-}]$  are from this study, and %CaCO<sub>3</sub>, >63 µm, and fragmentation are from ref. <sup>26</sup>. MD07-3076 data are from ref. <sup>28</sup>. Age models and  $\delta^{18}$ O references are given in Supplementary Table 1. All cores show lower deep-water  $[CO_3^{2^-}]$  during the LGM than the Holocene.



**Extended Data Fig. 3** | Deep-water  $[CO_3^{2^*}]$  based on benthic B/Ca along with qualitative  $[CO_3^{2^*}]$  proxies in core TNO57-21 from the abyssal depth (-5 km) in the South Atlantic. Also shown are  $%CaCO_3$  for another two abyssal cores RC11-83 (41.6°S, 9.8°E, 4718m) and ODP 1089 (40.9°S, 9.9°E, 4621m). Data are from refs. <sup>15,42,60</sup>. All cores suggest slightly higher  $[CO_3^{2^*}]$  at -5 km in the South Atlantic during the LGM than the Holocene.

60. Ninnemann, U. S. & Charles, C. D. Changes in the mode of Southern Ocean circulation over the last glacial cycle revealed by foraminiferal stable isotopic variability. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 201, 383–396 (2002).

	[CO <sub>3</sub> <sup>2-</sup> ]	DIC	ref	$\delta^{13}$ C	ref	εNd	[Nd]	ref
	µmol/kg	µmol/kg		‰			pmol/kg	
NADW	120	2140	23	1.3	3	-13.5	17.5	3
AABW	83	2250	23	0.4	1,58	-8.5	25.1	3
PDW	50	2380	11	-0.2	11,34	-3.5	35	3
						-13.5 to		
GNAIW	142 ± 8	2200#	*	1.5	1,58	-10.5	17.5	εNd: <sup>3,29</sup> ; [Nd]: <sup>3</sup>
GAABW	87 ± 4	2400#	*	-0.83	58	-6.72	25.1	$\epsilon$ Nd: *; [Nd]: <sup>3</sup>
GPDW	50	2600#	37,38	-0.4	34,36	-3.5	35	εNd: <sup>35</sup> ; [Nd]: <sup>3</sup>

**Extended Data Fig. 4 | Endmembers for modern and LGM water masses.** #: Italic numbers are assumed values, and using other values would have little effect on mixing lines shown in Fig. 3, due to insensitivity of mixing curvature to DIC values (see Extended Data Fig. 6). \*: This study; see Supplementary Tables 1 and 2 for cores used to define associated endmembers.



**Extended Data Fig. 5 | Meridional Pacific Ocean [CO<sub>3</sub>2-] distribution. a**,  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  transect. **b**, hydrographic sites<sup>11</sup> used to generate **a**. Today, the core of PDW is located at ~1-2 km in the polar North Pacific with a  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  of ~50 µmol/kg. The low  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  signature can be traced in the Southern Ocean (~50°S) due to the southward transport (southward black arrows) of PDW at ~1-2 km<sup>33</sup>. During the LGM, the core of GPDW is thought to deepen to ~3 km (dashed half circle)<sup>34</sup>. Our study suggests that the southward transport (dashed arrows) of GPDW was more extensive. By the time when GPDW was transported to the Pacific sector of the Southern Ocean, its signals would be transported via ACC (circle with an inner dot; transport out of the page) to the South Atlantic Ocean. White circles indicate cores at 3-4 km from the equatorial Pacific Ocean shown in Fig. 3. These cores show lower  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  than the abyssal South Atlantic waters (TNO57-21), indicating that GPDW likely had lower  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  than GAABW.

## **NATURE GEOSCIENCE**



**Extended Data Fig. 6 | Alternative scenarios that may contribute to interpretation of the LGM data. a**, as Fig. 3d, but only triple [Nd] of GNAIW. New mixing trend is shown by the blue region. **b**, as Fig. 3d, but only invoke various degrees of biological respiration (dashed horizontal arrows) associated with GPDW-GAABW-GNAIW mixtures. **c**, as Fig. 3d, but mixing (blue region) with an aged and hence lower  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  (70 µmol/kg) GAABW. **Note that** these are just some examples that can potentially contribute to explaining the LGM data, and should not be treated as exhaustive. At present, uncertainties (for example, large endmember  $\varepsilon$ Nd ranges and largely unconstrained [Nd]) preclude quantification of mixing ratios and respiration effects and their relative importance. Nevertheless, the more radiogenic  $\varepsilon$ Nd at 3.8 km (Fig. 1) would require mixing with GPDW.



**Extended Data Fig. 7 | Mixing curvature to water-mass endmember DIC and Nd contents.** Effect of endmember DIC changes on (a)  $\delta^{13}$ C-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] and (b)  $\epsilon$ Nd-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>]. Relative to the reference cases (grey lines), DIC<sub>GNAIW</sub> and DIC<sub>GAABW</sub> are decreased and increased by 200 µmol/kg, respectively, to intentionally enlarge the DIC contrast between water masses. Effect of endmember [Nd] changes on (c)  $\delta^{13}$ C-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] and (d)  $\epsilon$ Nd-[CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>]. Endmember [Nd] are varied from 1/3 to 3x of the reference value for (c) GNAIW and (d) GAABW. To simplify the view, only GNIAW and GAABW are shown, and GNIAW  $\epsilon$ Nd is only considered at –13.5. This figure suggests that mixing curvature is insensitive to endmember DIC changes, but sensitive to [Nd] changes.

## **NATURE GEOSCIENCE**



**Extended Data Fig. 8 | Zonal distribution of [CO\_3^{2^-}] in the Southern Ocean. a**, Seawater  $[CO_3^{2^-}]$  for three sectors of the Southern Ocean. **b**, Hydrographic sites  $(-50-60^{\circ}S)^{11}$  used to generate **a**. In today's Southern Ocean,  $[CO_3^{2^-}]$  is not zonally homogeneous. Instead, the low- $[CO_3^{2^-}]$  PDW signature is seen in relatively restricted regions at -1-2 km in the Pacific sector of the Southern Ocean. Via ACC, this signal would be transported to other sectors including the South Atlantic, although its influence is not very clearly seen due to strong vertical mixing that tends to erode any signal anomalies. Our study suggests that the influence of GDPW was more extensive and deeper (-3-4 km) in the Southern Ocean during the LGM. GPDW influence is recorded by  $[CO_3^{2^-}]$  and other proxies (for example,  $\varepsilon$ Nd and <sup>14</sup>C) from the deep South Atlantic.



**Extended Data Fig. 9 | Scenarios for different GAABW**  $\delta^{13}$ **C values. a**, "Mackensen" effects that would affect both deep-water  $\delta^{13}$ C and [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>]. **b**, Habitat change that only affects deep-water  $\delta^{13}$ C. See "GAABW  $\delta^{13}$ C endmember" in Methods for details.

				Holocene		LGM		LGM-HOL diff
Core	Lat.	Long.	water depth	[CO <sub>3</sub> <sup>2-</sup> ]	sd	[CO <sub>3</sub> <sup>2-</sup> ]	sd	[CO <sub>3</sub> <sup>2-</sup> ]
	٥N	٥W	m	μmol/kg		μmol/kg		μmol/kg
BOFS 8K	DFS 8K 53 22 4045		102	7	80	4	-22	
BOFS 5K	51	22	3547	110	4	95	5	-15
MD95-2039	41	10	3381	106	6	89	6	-16
MD01-2446 39		13	3576	106	1	83	9	-24
BOFS 29K	BOFS 29K 20		4000	108	11	86	5	-22
EW9209-2JPC	6	44	3528	106	5	90	4	-16
KNR110 GGC66 5		43	3550	111	1	94	5	-17
RC16-59 4		43	3520	112	1	98	6	-14
GeoB1118 -4		16	4671	84	5	78	5	-6
RC13-228	-22	-11	3204	101	3	79	4	-22
RC13-229 -2		-11	4191	87	2	68	6	-19
MD96-2085 -30		-13	3001	97	5	72	5	-25
TNO57-21	-41	-8	4981	86	4	87	4	0
TNO57-6	TNO57-6 -43 -9 3702		83	1	65	5	-19	
MD07-3076CQ -44 14 3770		3770	95	5	71	4	-24	
						Average:		-17
						sd:		7

Extended Data Fig. 10 | LGM-Holocene [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] difference for cores from >3 km in the Atlantic. sd: standard deviation.